## Comparison: Whole-body massage compared with no massage

Source: Priyadarshi M, Kumar V, Balachander B, Gupta S, Sankar MJ. Effect of whole-body massage on growth and neurodevelopment in term healthy newborns: a systematic review (submitted).

|               | Certainty assessment |                              |                      |              |                             |                      |                       | № of patients |                      | Effect   |                      |            |
|---------------|----------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--------------|-----------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|---------------|----------------------|--|----------------------|------------|
| Nº of studies | Study design         | Risk of<br>bias              | Inconsistency        | Indirectness | Imprecision                 | Other considerations | Whole-body<br>massage | No massage    | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute<br>(95% CI)   | Certainty<br>(GRADE) | Importance |
| Weight (      | g) – end of interv   | ention period                | I                    |              |                             |                      |                       |               |                      |  |                      |            |
| 16            | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | serious <sup>b</sup> | not serious  | not serious                 | none                 | 1072                  | 1076          | -                    | MD <b>343.43 higher</b> (260.73 higher to 426.12 higher)     | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Weight (      | (g) – follow-up at   | 8–12 months                  |                      |              |                             |                      |                       |               |                      |  |                      |            |
| 2             | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious          | not serious  | serious <sup>c</sup>        | none                 | 74                    | 83            | -                    | MD <b>455.07 higher</b><br>(86.33 higher to<br>823.8 higher) | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Length (      | cm) – end of inter   | vention perio                | od                   | •            | •                           | •                    | •                     | •             | •                    |  |                      | •          |
| 8             | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious          | not serious  | not serious                 | none                 | 630                   | 630           | -                    | MD <b>1.53 higher</b><br>(1.37 higher to 1.70<br>higher)     | ⊕⊕○○<br>LOW          | CRITICAL   |
| Length (      | cm) – follow-up a    | t 12 months                  |                      | •            |                             |                      |                       |               |                      |  |                      |            |
| 1             | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious          | not serious  | very serious <sup>c,d</sup> | none                 | 54                    | 62            | -                    | MD <b>0.71 higher</b><br>(0.15 lower to 1.57<br>higher)      | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Head cir      | cumference (cm)      | end of inte                  | vention period       |              |                             |                      |                       |               |                      |  |                      |            |
| 6             | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | serious <sup>b</sup> | not serious  | not serious                 | none                 | 500                   | 500           | -                    | MD <b>0.85 higher</b><br>(0.57 higher to 1.14<br>higher)     | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |

|                  |                      |                              | Certainty asse       | ssment           |                             |                      | Nº of ∣               | patients   |                      | Effect  | Certainty<br>(GRADE) | Importance |
|------------------|----------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|------------|----------------------|---|----------------------|------------|
| Nº of<br>studies | Study design         | Risk of<br>bias              | Inconsistency        | Indirectness     | Imprecision                 | Other considerations | Whole-body<br>massage | No massage | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute<br>(95% CI)                                      |                      |            |
| Head cir         | cumference (cm)      | – follow-up a                | t 6 months           |                  |                             |                      |                       |            |                      |   |                      |            |
| 1                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious          | not serious      | serious <sup>c</sup>        | none                 | 55                    | 60         | -                    | MD <b>1.31 higher</b><br>(0.55 higher to 2.07<br>higher)  | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Bilirubin        | levels at 4 days     |                              |                      |                  |                             |                      |                       |            |                      |   |                      |            |
| 4                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious          | not serious      | serious <sup>c</sup>        | none                 | 168                   | 177        | -                    | MD <b>31.75 lower</b><br>(40.05 lower to<br>23.46 lower)  | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Sleep du         | ıration over 24-ho   | ur period (ho                | ours/day) – end of   | intervention     |                             |                      |                       |            |                      |   |                      |            |
| 3                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | serious <sup>b</sup> | not serious      | not serious                 | none                 | 266                   | 268        | -                    | MD <b>0.62 higher</b><br>(0.12 higher to 1.12<br>higher)  | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Sleep du         | ıration over 24-ho   | ur period (ho                | ours/day) – follow   | -up at 6 months  | <u> </u>                    | 1                    | l                     | l          | l                    |   |                      | l          |
| 1                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious          | not serious      | very serious <sup>c,d</sup> | none                 | 61                    | 63         | -                    | MD <b>0.08 higher</b><br>(0.48 lower to 0.64<br>higher)   | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Psychom          | notor Developmer     | nt Indices (PD               | I) meta-analysis p   | ost-interventio  | n – end of interve          | ntion period         | l                     | ·          |                      |   |                      | l          |
| 3                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious          | not serious      | serious <sup>c</sup>        | none                 | 234                   | 154        | -                    | SMD <b>0.39 higher</b><br>(0.6 higher to 0.18<br>higher)  | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Psychom          | notor Developmer     | nt Indices (PD               | I) meta-analysis p   | ost-interventio  | n – follow-up at 24         | 1 months             |                       |            |                      |   |                      |            |
| 1                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious          | not serious      | very serious <sup>c,d</sup> | none                 | 20                    | 21         | -                    | SMD <b>7.52 higher</b><br>(1.49 lower to<br>16.53 higher) | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Mental I         | Development Indi     | ces (MDI) me                 | ta-analysis post-i   | ntervention – er | nd of intervention          | period               |                       |            |                      |   |                      |            |
| 3                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | serious <sup>b</sup> | not serious      | very serious <sup>c,d</sup> | none                 | 234                   | 154        | -                    | SMD <b>0.29 higher</b><br>(0.18 lower to<br>0.77higher)   | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |

|                  |                      |                              | Certainty assessment |                   |                             |                      |                       | № of patients |                      | Effect  |                      |            |
|------------------|----------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|---------------|----------------------|---|----------------------|------------|
| Nº of<br>studies | Study design         | Risk of<br>bias              | Inconsistency        | Indirectness      | Imprecision                 | Other considerations | Whole-body<br>massage | No massage    | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute<br>(95% CI)                                      | Certainty<br>(GRADE) | Importance |
| Mental I         | Development Indi     | ces (MDI) me                 | ta-analysis – follo  | w-up at 24 mon    | ths                         |                      |                       |               |                      |   |                      |            |
| 1                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious          | not serious       | very serious <sup>c,d</sup> | none                 | 20                    | 21            | -                    | SMD <b>8.59 higher</b><br>(1.62 lower to<br>18.80 higher) | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Gross m          | otor development     | t at end of int              | tervention (Gesell   | development q     | uotient/Capital In          | stitute mental ch    | ecklist)              |               |                      |   |                      |            |
| 2                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious          | not serious       | serious <sup>c</sup>        | none                 | 117                   | 120           | -                    | SMD <b>0.44 higher</b><br>(0.18 higher to 0.7<br>higher)  | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Fine mo          | tor development      | at end of inte               | rvention (Gesell o   | levelopment qu    | otient/Capital Inst         | titute mental che    | cklist)               |               |                      |   |                      | •          |
| 2                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious          | not serious       | serious <sup>c</sup>        | none                 | 117                   | 120           | -                    | SMD <b>0.61 higher</b><br>(0.35 higher to 0.87<br>higher) | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Languag          | e at end of interv   | ention (Gesel                | l development qu     | otient/Capital II | nstitute mental ch          | ecklist)             |                       |               |                      |   |                      |            |
| 2                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | serious <sup>b</sup> | not serious       | very serious <sup>c,d</sup> | none                 | 117                   | 120           | -                    | SMD <b>0.82 higher</b><br>(0.03 lower to 1.67<br>higher)  | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Persona          | l-social behaviour   | at end of int                | ervention (Gesell    | development qu    | uotient/Capital Ins         | stitute mental che   | ecklist)              |               |                      |   |                      | I          |
| 2                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | serious <sup>b</sup> | not serious       | serious <sup>c</sup>        | none                 | 117                   | 120           | -                    | SMD <b>0.9 higher</b><br>(0.18 higher to 1.61<br>higher)  | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Gross m          | otor developmen      | t at 12 month                | ıs (Gesell develop   | ment quotient)    |                             |                      | l                     |               |                      |   |                      | l          |
| 1                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious          | not serious       | very serious <sup>c,d</sup> | none                 | 54                    | 62            | -                    | MD <b>2.85 higher</b><br>(2.48 lower to 8.18<br>higher)   | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Fine mo          | tor development a    | at 12 months                 | (Gesell developm     | ent quotient)     | 1                           | •                    | 1                     |               |                      |   |                      | 1          |
| 1                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious          | not serious       | serious <sup>c</sup>        | none                 | 54                    | 62            | -                    | MD <b>8.12 higher</b><br>(4.57 higher to<br>11.67 higher) | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |

|                  |                      |                              | Certainty asse     | ssment         |                      | № of patients        |                       | Effect     |                      | C. J. J. J.   |                      |            |
|------------------|----------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|----------------|----------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|------------|----------------------|---|----------------------|------------|
| Nº of<br>studies | Study design         | Risk of<br>bias              | Inconsistency      | Indirectness   | Imprecision          | Other considerations | Whole-body<br>massage | No massage | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute<br>(95% CI)                                      | Certainty<br>(GRADE) | Importance |
| Languag          | e at 12 months (G    | esell develop                | ment quotient)     |                |                      |                      |                       |            |                      |   |                      |            |
| 1                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious        | not serious    | serious <sup>c</sup> | none                 | 54                    | 62         | -                    | MD <b>7.9 higher</b><br>(4.1 higher to 11.7<br>higher)    | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Persona          | l-social behaviour   | at 12 month                  | s (Gesell developr | nent quotient) |                      |                      |                       |            |                      |   |                      |            |
| 1                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious        | not serious    | serious <sup>c</sup> | none                 | 54                    | 62         | -                    | MD <b>6.19 higher</b><br>(2.55 higher to 9.83<br>higher)  | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Materna          | l Attachment Inve    | entory score                 |                    |                |                      |                      |                       |            |                      |   |                      |            |
| 1                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious        | not serious    | serious <sup>c</sup> | none                 | 57                    | 60         | -                    | MD <b>5.77 higher</b><br>(0.95 higher to<br>10.59 higher) | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Crying o         | r fussing time – er  | nd of interver               | ntion              |                |                      |                      |                       |            | ı                    |   |                      | I          |
| 3                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious        | not serious    | serious <sup>c</sup> | none                 | 136                   | 135        | -                    | MD <b>0.36 lower</b><br>(0.16 lower to 0.56<br>lower)     | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Crying o         | r fussing time – fo  | llow-up at 6                 | months             |                |                      |                      |                       |            | •                    | ,   |                      |            |
| 1                | randomized<br>trials | very<br>serious <sup>a</sup> | not serious        | not serious    | serious <sup>c</sup> | none                 | 61                    | 63         | -                    | MD <b>0.15 lower</b><br>(0.01 lower to 0.29<br>lower)     | ⊕○○○<br>VERY LOW     | CRITICAL   |

CI: confidence interval; MD: mean difference; SMD: standardized mean difference.

a. The pooled effect provided by studies C.

b. Severe, unexplained, heterogeneity ( $I^2 \ge 60\%$  or  $Chi^2 < 0.05$ ).

c. Less than 400 participants.

d. Wide confidence interval crossing the line of no effect.